



Article

A Study on the Fruiting and Correlation between the Chemical Indicators and Antimicrobial Properties of *Hippophae rhamnoides* L.

Natalia Netreba ^{1,*}, Elisaveta Sandulachi ¹, Artur Macari ¹, Sergiu Popa ^{2,*}, Ion Ribintev ², Iuliana Sandu ¹, Olga Boestean ¹ and Irina Dianu ¹

- Faculty of Food Technology, Technical University of Moldova, 168 Ştefan cel Mare Street, MD-2004 Chişinău, Moldova; luiza.sandulachi@gmail.com (E.S.); artur.macari@tpa.utm.md (A.M.); iuliana.sandu@tpa.utm.md (I.S.); olga.boestean@tpa.utm.md (O.B.); irina.dianu@doctorat.utm.md (I.D.)
- Faculty of Agricultural, Forest and Environmental Sciences, Technical University of Moldova, 168 Ştefan cel Mare Street, MD-2004 Chişinău, Moldova; ion.ribintev@h.utm.md
- * Correspondence: natalia.netreba@tpa.utm.md (N.N.); sergiu.popa@h.utm.md (S.P.)

Abstract: Sea buckthorn is a promising species that, under the conditions of Eastern Europe, has shown high productivity and is also a good and possible source of a wide range of bioactive compounds that have a positive effect on the human body, especially polyphenols and carotenoids. Due to the content of biologically active substances in sea buckthorn (Hippophae rhamnoides L.), the species is of growing interest to scientists, the food industry, the pharmaceutical industry, the cosmetics industry and consumers. The aim of this study is to investigate the productivity and the correlation between the chemical composition and the antibacterial effect of four cultivars of sea buckthorn (Clara, Dora, Cora, Mara), cultivated in the Republic of Moldova. Sea buckthorn fruits were harvested at the stage of full ripening. Berry samples were frozen at minus 25 °C, stored for 6 months and whole fruits of sea buckthorn were studied. All quantitative characteristics were calculated in terms of absolutely dry raw material (dry weight). The sea buckthorn cultivars tested were found to have a different carotenoid contents (1.79-48.92 mg/100 g), ascorbic acid contents (74.36-373.38 mg/100 g), organic acids (malic acid 5.8–13.4 mg/100 g, citric acid 0.08–0.321 mg/100 g, succinic acid 0.03–1.1 mg/100 g), total dry matter contents (16.71–24.54%), titratable acidities (2.15–8.76%) and pH values (2.73–3.00). The antimicrobial activity of sea buckthorn, evaluated by the diameter of the inhibition zone, constituted for Bacillus pumilus 3.70–15.91 mm/g $^{-1}$ for whole sea buckthorn fruits and 13.33–26.67 mm/g $^{-1}$ for sea buckthorn purees.

Keywords: sea buckthorn; variety; productivity; *Hippophae rhamnoides* L.; carotenoids; antimicrobial activity; *Bacillus pumilus*



Citation: Netreba, N.; Sandulachi, E.; Macari, A.; Popa, S.; Ribintev, I.; Sandu, I.; Boestean, O.; Dianu, I. A Study on the Fruiting and Correlation between the Chemical Indicators and Antimicrobial Properties of *Hippophae rhamnoides* L.. *Horticulturae* 2024, 10, 137. https://doi.org/10.3390/horticulturae10020137

Academic Editors: Lixiang Miao and Xiaobai Li

Received: 15 December 2023 Revised: 22 January 2024 Accepted: 23 January 2024 Published: 31 January 2024



Copyright: © 2024 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Due to its valuable nutritional benefits and therapeutic properties, sea buckthorn has gained a particular attention and interest compared with other species of flowering plants. Despite this, sea buckthorn has not known a widespread cultivation due to the low productivity of the plants and the presence of dense thorns, which represents a major impediment to manual harvesting. However, with the emergence of highly productive varieties (20 t/ha) and fruit harvesting machines, producers are showing an exceptional interest in sea buckthorn cultivation and the crop is in high demand (in unlimited quantities) on the international market.

Sea buckthorn is a relevant source of vitamins (the most important being vitamins C and E, but vitamins B_1 , B_2 and K and bioflavonoids are also present), macro and microelements (nitrogen, phosphorus, iron, manganese, boron, calcium, aluminium, silicon and others) and antioxidants (catechin, myricetin, quercetin, p-coumaric acid, caffeic acid, L-ascorbic acid and gallic acid) [1–4]. Currently, papers containing experimental data

obtained by various international researchers supporting the consumption of sea buckthorn fruits as functional foods [5–7], the use of the fruit as therapeutic remedies [8–10] and their use as sources of natural antioxidants with antimicrobial properties by the food industry [11–14]. Sea buckthorn fruits have a great potential as antimicrobial compounds against microorganisms [15,16]. So, these berries can be used to control the stability of stored food [17,18].

The antioxidant and antimicrobial activity of sea buckthorn depends on the chemical composition of the berries [19,20]. Published experimental data [21,22] support the consumption of sea buckthorn fruits as functional foods and their use as sources of natural antioxidants by the food industry. The content of biologically active substances and the level of antioxidant activity of sea buckthorn depend on growing conditions, agricultural technology and climate [23,24].

The aim of this study was to determine the relationship between the antimicrobial properties of sea buckthorn fruits and the chemical parameters (ascorbic acid content (AAC), organic acids (OA), carotenoid content (CC), total dry matter (TDM), titratable acidity (TA) and pH) of the berries.

References

1. Small, E.; Catling, P.; Li, T. Blossoming treasures of biodiversity: 5. Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides*)—An ancient crop with modern virtues. *Biodiversity* **2002**, *3*, 25–27. [CrossRef]

- 2. Dong, R.; Su, J.; Nian, H.; Shen, H.; Zhai, X.; Xin, H.; Qin, L.; Han, T. Chemical Fingerprint and Quantitative Analysis of Flavonoids for Quality Control of Sea Buckthorn Leaves by HPLC and UHPLC-ESI-QTOF-MS. *J. Funct. Foods* **2017**, *37*, 513–522. [CrossRef]
- Tian, Y.; Liimatainen, J.; Alanne, A.-L.; Lindstedt, A.; Liu, P.; Sinkkonen, J.; Kallio, H.; Yang, B. Phenolic Compounds Extracted by Acidic Aqueous Ethanol from Berries and Leaves of Different Berry Plants. Food Chem. 2017, 220, 266–281. [CrossRef]
- Sharma, U.; Sharma, N.; Sharma, N.; Sharma, A.; Singh, H.; Sinha, A.K. Microwave-Assisted Efficient Extraction of Different Parts of *Hippophae rhamnoides* for the Comparative Evaluation of Antioxidant Activity and Quantification of Its Phenolic Constituents by Reverse-Phase High-Performance Liquid Chromatography (RP-HPLC). *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 2008, 56, 374–379. [CrossRef]
- 5. Beveridge, T.; Li, T.; Oomah, B.; Smith, A. Sea Buckthorn Products: Manufacture and Composition. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **1999**, 47, 3480–3488. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 6. Jaśniewska, A.; Diowksz, A. Wide Spectrum of Active Compounds in Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides*) for Disease Prevention and Food Production. *Antioxidants* **2021**, *10*, 1279. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 7. Tudor, C.; Bohn, T.; Iddir, M.; Dulf, F.V.; Focşan, M.; Rugină, D.O.; Pintea, A. Sea Buckthorn Oil as a Valuable Source of Bioaccessible Xanthophylls. *Nutrients* **2019**, *12*, 76. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 8. Ercisli, S.; Orhan, E.; Ozdemir, O.; Sengul, M. The Genotypic Effects on the Chemical Composition and Antioxidant Activity of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) Berries Grown in Turkey. *Sci. Hortic.* **2007**, *115*, 27–33. [CrossRef]
- 2. Zhang, W.; Yan, J.; Duo, J.; Ren, B.; Guo, J. Preliminary study of biochemical constitutions of berry of sea buckthorn growing in Shanxi province and their changing trend. In Proceedings of the International Symposium on Sea Buckthorn (*H. rhamnoides* L.), Xi'an, China, 19–23 October 1989; pp. 96–105.
- 10. Solà Marsiñach, M.; Cuenca, A.P. The Impact of Sea Buckthorn Oil Fatty Acids on Human Health. *Lipids Health Dis.* **2019**, *18*, 145. [CrossRef]
- 11. Sandulachi, E.; Bulgaru, V.; Ghendov-Mosanu, A.; Sturza, R. Controlling the Risk of Bacillus in Food Using Berries. *Food Nutr. Sci.* **2021**, *12*, 557–577. [CrossRef]
- 12. Sandulachi, E.; Cojocari, D.; Balan, G.; Popescu, L.; Ghendov-Moṣanu, A.; Sturza, R. Antimicrobial Effects of Berries on *Listeria monocytogenes*. Food Nutr. Sci. 2020, 11, 873–886. [CrossRef]
- 13. Sturza, R.; Sandulachi, E.; Cojocari, D.; Balan, G.; Popescu, L.; Ghendov-Mosanu, A. Antimicrobial properties of berry powders in cream cheese. *J. Eng. Sci.* **2019**, *26*, 125–136.
- 14. Cojocari, D.; Sturza, R.; Sandulachi, E.; Macari, A.; Balan, G.; Ghendov-Mosanu, A. Inhibiting of accidental pathogenic microbiota in meat products with berry powders. *J. Eng. Sci.* **2019**, *26*, 114–122.
- 15. Tyagi, N.; Singh, A.; Kohli, K. New Insights towards Implications of Sea Buckthorn Oil in Human Health: A Review. *Int. J. Pharmacogn. Chin. Med.* **2018**, *4*, 1204–1208.
- 16. Mohan Gupta, S.; Gupta, A.K.; Ahmed, Z. Antibacterial and Antifungal Activity in Leaf, Seed Extract and Seed Oil of Seabuckthorn (*Hippophae Salicifolia* D. Don) Plant. *J. Plant Pathol. Microbiol.* **2011**, 2, 1–4. [CrossRef]
- 17. Schubertová, S.; Krepsová, Z.; Janotková, L.; Potočňáková, M.; Kreps, F. Exploitation of Sea Buckthorn Fruit for Novel Fermented Foods Production: A Review. *Processes* **2021**, *9*, 749. [CrossRef]
- 18. Kallio, H.; Yang, W.; Liu, P.; Yang, B. Proanthocyanidins in Wild Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophaë rhamnoides*) Berries Analyzed by Reversed-Phase, Normal-Phase, and Hydrophilic Interaction Liquid Chromatography with UV and MS Detection. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2014**, 62, 7721–7729. [CrossRef]
- 19. Teleszko, M.; Wojdyło, A.; Rudzińska, M.; Oszmiański, J.; Golis, T. Analysis of Lipophilic and Hydrophilic Bioactive Compounds Content in Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophaë rhamnoides* L.) Berries. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2015**, *63*, 4120–4129. [CrossRef]
- 20. Criste, A.; Urcan, A.C.; Bunea, A.; Pripon Furtuna, F.R.; Olah, N.K.; Madden, R.H.; Corcionivoschi, N. Phytochemical Composition and Biological Activity of Berries and Leaves from Four Romanian Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) Varieties. *Molecules* 2020, 25, 1170. [CrossRef]
- 21. Gatlan, A.-M.; Gutt, G. Sea Buckthorn in Plant Based Diets. An Analytical Approach of Sea Buckthorn Fruits Composition: Nutritional Value, Applications, and Health Benefits. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2021**, *18*, 8986. [CrossRef]
- Terechuk, L.; Starovoytova, K.; Ivanova, S.; Sergeeva, I. Obtaining Functional Products from Sea Buckthorn Berries. In Proceedings
 of the 2nd International Conference on Education Science and Social Development (ESSD 2019), Changsha, China, 20–21 July
 2019; Atlantis Press: Changsha, China, 2019.
- 23. Yang, B.; Kallio, H.P. Fatty Acid Composition of Lipids in Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophaë rhamnoides* L.) Berries of Different Origins. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2001**, 49, 1939–1947. [CrossRef]

24. Yue, X.-F.; Shang, X.; Zhang, Z.-J.; Zhang, Y.-N. Phytochemical Composition and Antibacterial Activity of the Essential Oils from Different Parts of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.). *J. Food Drug Anal.* **2017**, *25*, 327–332. [CrossRef]

- 25. Catalog of Plant Varieties for Year 2023. Available online: https://cstsp.md/uploads/files/Registrul_2023_Tipar_Gray.pdf (accessed on 5 January 2024).
- 26. Latimer, G.W. (Ed.) Official Methods of Analysis of AOAC International, 22nd ed.; Oxford University Press: New York, NY, USA, 2023.
- 27. Siriangkhawut, W. Electrochemical Analysis of Ascorbic Acid in Commercial Fruit Juices and Drinks. *Asian J. Chem.* **2014**, *26*, 6487–6491. [CrossRef]
- 28. Ferey, L.; Delaunay, N. Food Analysis on Electrophoretic Microchips. Sep. Purif. Rev. 2016, 45, 193–226. [CrossRef]
- 29. Wang, M.; Qu, F.; Shan, X.-Q.; Lin, J.-M. Development and Optimization of a Method for the Analysis of Low-Molecular-Mass Organic Acids in Plants by Capillary Electrophoresis with Indirect UV Detection. *J. Chromatogr. A* 2003, 989, 285–292. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 30. Rovio, S.; Sirén, K.; Sirén, H. Application of Capillary Electrophoresis to Determine Metal Cations, Anions, Organic Acids, and Carbohydrates in Some Pinot Noir Red Wines. *Food Chem.* **2011**, *124*, 1194–1200. [CrossRef]
- 31. Ghendov-Mosanu, A.; Netreba, N.; Balan, G.; Cojocari, D.; Boestean, O.; Bulgaru, V.; Gurev, A.; Popescu, L.; Deseatnicova, O.; Resitca, V.; et al. Effect of Bioactive Compounds from Pumpkin Powder on the Quality and Textural Properties of Shortbread Cookies. *Foods* **2023**, *12*, 3907. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 32. Beveridge, T.; Harrison, J.E.; Drover, J. Processing Effects on the Composition of Sea Buckthorn Juice from *Hippophae rhamnoides* L. Cv. Indian Summer. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2002**, *50*, 113–116. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 33. Hudzicki, J. Kirby-Bauer Disk Diffusion Susceptibility Test Protocol. Am. Soc. Microbiol. 2016, 15, 55–63.
- 34. Valgas, C.; De Souza, S.; Smânia, E. Screening methods to determine antibacterial activity of natural products. *Braz. J. Microbiol.* **2007**, *38*, 369–380. [CrossRef]
- 35. Clewer, A.; Scarisbrick, D. *Practical Statistics and Experimental Design for Plant and Crop Science*; John Wiley & Sons Ltd.: Chichester, UK, 2001.
- 36. Babeanu, N.; Cimpoies, D.; Lica, D.; Racul, A. Biometrie; Ed. UASM: Chisinau, Moldova, 2012.
- 37. Michel, T.; Destandau, E.; Le Floch, G.; Lucchesi, M.E.; Elfakir, C. Antimicrobial, Antioxidant and Phytochemical Investigations of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophaë rhamnoides* L.) Leaf, Stem, Root and Seed. *Food Chem.* **2012**, *131*, 754–760. [CrossRef]
- 38. Gao, X.; Ohlander, M.; Jeppsson, N.; Björk, L.; Trajkovski, V. Changes in Antioxidant Effects and Their Relationship to Phytonutrients in Fruits of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) during Maturation. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2000**, *48*, 1485–1490. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 39. Bal, L.; Meda, V.; Naik, S.; Satya, S. Sea buckthorn berries: A potential source of valuable nutrients for nutraceuticals and cosmoceuticals. *Food Res. Int.* **2011**, *44*, 1718–1727. [CrossRef]
- 40. Classification of Food on Basis of Acidity. Available online: https://foodtechnotes.com/2020/10/27/classification-of-food-on-basis-of-acidity/ (accessed on 30 December 2023).
- 41. Munkhbayar, D.; Ariuntungalag, J.; Delgersuuri, G.; Badamkhand, D. Enzymatic Technology for Sea Buckthorn Oil Extraction and Its Biochemical Analysis. *Mong. J. Chem.* **2014**, *15*, 62–65. [CrossRef]
- 42. Upadhyay, N.; Yogendra Kumar, M.; Gupta, A. Antioxidant, Cytoprotective and Antibacterial Effects of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) Leaves. *Food Chem. Toxicol.* **2010**, *48*, 3443–3448. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 43. Lee, Y.H.; Jang, H.J.; Park, K.H.; Kim, S.H.; Kim, J.K.; Kim, J.C.; Jang, T.S.; Kim, K.H. Phytochemical Analysis of the Fruits of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides*): Identification of Organic Acid Derivatives. *Plants* **2021**, *10*, 860. [CrossRef]
- 44. Famiani, F.; Bonghi, C.; Chen, Z.-H.; Drincovich, M.; Farinelli, D.; Lara, M.; Proietti, S.; Rosati, A.; Vizzotto, G.; Walker, R. Stone Fruits: Growth and Nitrogen and Organic Acid Metabolism in the Fruits and Seeds—A Review. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2020, 11, 572–601. [CrossRef]
- 45. Famiani, F.; Battistelli, A.; Moscatello, S.; Cruz-Castillo, J.; Walker, R. The Organic Acids That Are Accumulated in the Flesh of Fruits: Occurrence, Metabolism and Factors Affecting Their Contents—A Review. *Rev. Chapingo Ser. Hortic.* 2015, 21, 97–128. [CrossRef]
- 46. Ma, Z.; Cui, Y.; Feng, G. Studies on the fruit character and biochemical compositions of some forms within Chinese sea buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoids* subsp. *sinensis*). In Proceedings of the International Symposium on Sea Buckthorn (*H. rhamnoides* L.), Xi'an, China, 19–23 October 1989; pp. 106–113.
- 47. Kallio, K.; Yang, B.; Tahvonen, R.; Hakala, M. Composition of sea buckthorn berries of various origins. In Proceedings of the International Symposium on Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoids* L.), Beijing, China, 29 August 1999.
- 48. Michalak, M.; Paradowska, K.; Zielińska, A. Selected plant oils as a source of carotenoids for the applications in cosmetology. *Postępy Fitoter.* **2018**, *1*, 10–17.
- 49. Mendelová, A.; Mendel, L'.; Czako, P.; Mareček, J. Evaluation of Carotenoids, Polyphenols Content and Antioxidant Activity in the Sea Buckthorn Fruit. *Potravin. Slovak J. Food Sci.* **2016**, *10*, 59–64. [CrossRef]
- 50. Beveridge, T. Chemical composition and some physical properties. In *Sea Buckthorn (Hippophaë rhamnoides L.): Production and Utilization;* NRC Research Press: Ottawa, ON, Canada, 2003; pp. 79–88.
- 51. Yakimishen, R.; Cenkowski, S.; Muir, W. Oil Recoveries from Sea Buckthorn Seeds and Pulp. *Appl. Eng. Agric.* **2005**, *21*, 1047–1055. [CrossRef]

52. Ivanišová, E.; Blašková, M.; Terentjeva, M.; Grygorieva, O.; Vergun, O.; Brindza, J.; Kačániová, M. Biological Properties of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) Derived Products. *Acta Sci. Pol. Technol. Aliment.* **2020**, *19*, 195–205. [PubMed]

- 53. Lõugas, T. Study on Physico-Chemical Properties and Some Bioactive Compounds of Sea Buckthorn (Hippophae rhamnoides L.); Thesis on Natural and Exact Sciences; TUT Press: Tallinn, Estonia, 2006.
- 54. Kumar, R.; Kumar, G.P.; Chaurasia, O.; Bala Singh, S. Phytochemical and Pharmacological Profile of Seabuckthorn Oil: A Review. *Res. J. Med. Plant* **2011**, *5*, 491–499. [CrossRef]
- 55. Qadir, M.; Abbas, K.; Younus, A.; Shaikh, R. Report—Antibacterial Activity of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) against Methicillin Resistant Staphylococcus Aureus (MRSA). *Pak. J. Pharm. Sci.* **2016**, 29, 1711–1713. [PubMed]
- 56. Smida, I.; Pentelescu, C.; Pentelescu, O.; Sweidan, A.; Oliviero, N.; Meuric, V.; Martin, B.; Colceriu, L.; Bonnaure-Mallet, M.; Tamanai-Shacoori, Z. Benefits of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides*) Pulp Oil-based Mouthwash on Oral Health. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 2019, 126, 1594–1605. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 57. Jeong, J.H. Antioxidant and Antimicrobial Activities of Extracts from a Medicinal Plant, Sea Buckthorn. *J. Korean Soc. Appl. Biol. Chem.* **2009**, *53*, 33–38.
- 58. Richa, A. Antimicrobial Activity of Seed, Pomace and Leaf Extracts of Sea Buckthorn (*Hippophae rhamnoides* L.) against Foodborne and Food Spoilage Pathogens. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* **2012**, *11*, 10424–10430. [CrossRef]
- 59. Kasparaviciene, G.; Briedis, V.; Ivanauskas, L. Influence of sea buckthorn oil production technology on its antioxidant activity. *Medicina* **2004**, 40, 753–757.
- 60. Sandulachi, E.; Macari, A.; Cojocari, D.; Balan, G.; Popa, S.; Turculet, N.; Ghendov-Mosanu, A.; Sturza, R. Antimicrobial properties of sea buckthorn grownin the republic of moldova. *J. Eng. Sci.* **2022**, *29*, 164–175. [CrossRef]
- 61. Stahl, W.; Sies, H. Antioxidant Activity of Carotenoids. Mol. Asp. Med. 2003, 24, 345–351. [CrossRef]
- 62. Shah, R.K.; Idate, A.; Sharma, P. Review on Antimicrobial Properties of Sea Buckthorn *Hippophae rhamnoides* L. *Int. J. All Res. Educ. Sci. Methods* **2020**, *8*, 1590–1599.
- 63. Merhan, O. The Biochemistry and Antioxidant Properties of Carotenoids. In *Carotenoids*; Cvetkovic, D.J., Nikolic, G.S., Eds.; InTech: Atyrau, Kazakhstan, 2017.
- 64. Kopsell, D. Accumulation and Bioavailability of Dietary Carotenoids in Vegetable Crops. *Trends Plant Sci.* **2006**, *11*, 499–507. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 65. Gammone, M.; Riccioni, G.; D'Orazio, N. Marine Carotenoids against Oxidative Stress: Effects on Human Health. *Mar. Drugs* **2015**, *13*, 6226–6246. [CrossRef]
- 66. Clark, S. xPharm: The Comprehensive Pharmacology Reference; Elsevier: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 2007.
- 67. Šnē, E.; Galoburda, R.; Segliņa, D. Sea Buckthorn Vegetative Parts—A Good Source of Bioactive Compounds. *Proc. Latv. Acad. Sci. Sect. B Nat. Exact Appl. Sci.* **2013**, 67, 101–108. [CrossRef]

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.